



71 Black Road
Unit 8
Sault Ste. Marie,
ON
P6B 0A3

T. 705 949.1457
F. 705 949.9606
TF. 866 806.6602

saultstemarie@TULLOCH.ca

May 14, 2025
24-1255

The Corporation of the City of Sault Ste. Marie
99 Foster Drive
Sault Ste. Marie, ON
P6A 5X6
Canada

Attention: **Ms. Virginia McLeod**
Manager of Recreation and Culture
Community Development and Enterprise Services

Re: Tender Submission Results
Memorial Tower Rehabilitation 2025 (2025CDE-CS-AR-03-T)

Dear Ms. McLeod:

We have reviewed the tender submissions received electronically via Bids and Tenders, by the Purchasing Department on or before 3:00PM, May 1st, 2025, for the above project and present here within our Tender Report (Evaluation).

1.0 Background

The project consisted of the following scope of work:

- Provide and install construction safety barriers, and signage as required.
- Complete all work in accordance with the Contract drawings, including, but not limited to:
 - Removal of all identified designated substances
 - Remove and replace concrete at the shoulders of the tower
 - Remove and replace existing roofing on the upper walkway
 - Repair all deteriorated concrete surfaces
 - Surface prepare and apply paint coating to all exterior concrete surfaces
- Clean up and removal from site of all surplus material.
- Demobilization from site.

The intent of this project was to restore the longevity of the tower by making repairs to deficient concrete, steel and exterior paint coatings.

There was a mandatory site visit required during the formal tender process. This visit occurred on April 15th, 2025, at 10:30am. Five (5) addendums were issued during the tender process.

2.0 Summary of Tenders

A total of four (4) tenders were received by the Purchasing Department prior to the deadline on May 1, 2025. The electronic tenders were opened at the Civic Centre, in the Purchasing Department at 3:05pm on May 1, 2025, and results were recorded.

The following were the results of the submitted tender values, exclusive of HST, in ascending order of contract price:

1. <i>Hastings Painting Corporation</i>	<i>\$529,730.00 + HST</i>
2. <i>Lignum Builders Limited</i>	<i>\$779,997.35 + HST</i>
3. <i>Nu-Style Construction Co. (1988) Limited</i>	<i>\$1,174,915.50 + HST</i>
4. <i>R.F. Contracting Incorporated</i>	<i>\$1,182,035.25 + HST</i>

3.0 Review of Tenders Received

The tenders were reviewed in detail to ensure that all submission requirements were complied with as stipulated in the tender documents. The following specific comments are noted:

1. The four (4) vendors were registered on the Bids and Tenders platform.
2. All bidders acknowledged receipt of the five (5) addendums.
3. The tenders were checked for mathematical errors and omissions. It is assumed that the unit rate price provided for the reinforcing steel in Nu-Style Construction Co. (1988) Limited's, bid was incorrect. It should be noted that even if the assumed error were to be corrected, the revised tendered value from Nu-Style Construction Co. (1988) Limited would not change the order of submitted bid values.

No other errors were noted in the pricing sections.

4. Three (3) of the four bidders included sub-contractor experience within their submission as stipulated in the bid form. Nu-Style Construction Co. (1988) Limited, did not include it in their submission.
5. All bidders provided a detailed schedule within their submission as stipulated in the bid form.
6. All bidders provided an Agreement to Bond as stipulated in the tender requirements.
7. All bidders provided a Bid Bond as stipulated in the tender requirements.

4.0 Conclusion

TULLOCH's cost estimate, exclusive of the paint coating (which is to be paid through an allowance) was \$855,000.00+HST. That cost estimate was prepared in 2023, consideration for average yearly inflation would have the potential to increase that cost estimate by as much as 10%, resulting in a pre-construction cost estimate of \$940,000.00+HST.

Hastings Painting Corporation submitted the lowest price for the work at \$529,730.00+HST. Hastings Painting Corporation's tendered price was approximately 50% of TULLOCH's pre-construction cost estimate.

Hastings Painting Corporation has submitted work experience within their bid form and has demonstrated their ability to execute the coating portion of the project, although no relevant experience regarding concrete rehabilitation was provided. As a substantial portion of this project involves the rehabilitation of concrete elements on the Memorial Tower, the absence of any relevant experience in this area makes providing a complete evaluation impossible.

Hastings Painting Corporation's extremely low tendered value combined with the absence of relevant project experience with concrete rehabilitation are concerning. Collectively, the two previously noted concerns with Hasting Painting Corporation's bid submission suggest that there may not have been a complete understanding of the project's scope of work.

TULLOCH does not have any related working experience with Hastings Painting Corporation; therefore, we are unable to provide insight into their capabilities or past performance.

The submitted tender price from Lignum Builders Limited (the second lowest bidder) was \$779,997.35+HST. Lignum Builders Limited's submitted tender package was compliant with all tender requirements. Their submitted work experience reflects the necessary experience for this project's scope of work.

The Tender documents have a privilege clause for the award of the contract; however, we recommend that The City of Sault Ste. Marie consult legal counsel for advice if required, prior to awarding a contract for this work.

Once you have reviewed the tender submissions and a decision has been made, please contact us so that we may notify the successful bidder.

Should you have any questions, or require clarification to any aspect of this project, please feel free to contact the undersigned at your convenience.

Yours truly,

TULLOCH Engineering Inc.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Dan Moody". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Dan Moody, A.Sc.T.
Project Manager

DM/dm



TENDER SUBMISSION EVALUATION SHEET												
Tenderer	GENERAL REQUIREMENT						TECHNICAL REQUIREMENTS					REMARKS
	Tender Price (w/o HST)	Registered with Bids and Tenders	Addenda (5 issued)	10% Bid Bond or Certified Cheque	Agreement to Bond (Surety's Consent) or	TENDER SUBMISSION FORM	SCHEDULE OF ITEMS AND PRICES	APPENDIX-A (BIDDER'S EXPERIENCE)	APPENDIX-B (PROPOSED SUB-CONTRACTORS)	APPENDIX-C (SUB-CONTRACTOR'S EXPERIENCE)	APPENDIX-D (SCHEDULE)	
Hastings Painting Corporation	\$529,730.00	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	*refer to written tender evaluation report
Lignum Builders Limited	\$779,997.35	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
Nu-Style Construction Co. (1988) Limited	\$1,174,915.50	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	
R.F. Contracting Inc.	\$1,182,035.25	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Table 1. - Tender Submittal Evaluation Sheet

- ✓ Indicates that the item was contained within the Tender Submission.
- X Indicates document not provided within the tender submission.
- O Indicates alternate document provided within the tender submission. or Indicates alternate document provided within changes or exceptions.